

Expert consultation meeting: Global Citizenship Education for a culture of lawfulness

Meeting report



Table of content

I. Background and objectives	p. 3
II. What is the rule of law and a culture of lawfulness?	p. 3
III. What is the role of education?	p. 4
IV. Learning to be ethically responsible agents of change	p. 6
V. Country case studies	p. 7
VI. Enabling educational policies	p. 8
VII. Closing considerations	p. 9

I. Background and objectives

1. **Background on the expert consultation meeting.** In the context of a UNESCO/UNODC partnership on “Global Citizenship Education for a Culture of Lawfulness”, an expert consultation meeting was held in Paris on March 15 and 16 of 2018. The purpose of the partnership is to strengthen the capacities of educational systems to promote the rule of law. To this end, the partnership aims to empower and equip learners to act and engage in society as constructive and ethically responsible agents of change, supporting peace, justice, and strong institutions. This notably contributes to the achievement of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, and in particular Sustainable Development Goals 4 and 16. Additionally, the partnership intends to enable learners to be both motivated and capable to respond resiliently to crime and violence.
2. **Strategic advantages of partnership.** The UNESCO/UNODC partnership is intentionally meant to draw on the strengths of the organizations and make use of their overlapping pursuits. Through its Global Citizenship Education initiatives, UNESCO promotes educational approaches that seek to empower learners to become proactive contributors to a more peaceful, tolerant, inclusive, and secure world. UNODC’s Education for Justice initiative, which is a key component of the Global Programme for the implementation of the Doha Declaration, develops education materials in UNODC mandated areas of crime prevention and criminal justice across primary, secondary, and tertiary education levels
3. **Partnership outputs.** The UNESCO/UNODC partnership aims to develop two sets of documents: a guidance document for education policymakers that outlines the role of education in the promotion of the rule of law and a culture of lawfulness; and a toolkit for teachers and educators at the primary and secondary levels that has a selection of activities, tips, resources, and references that help promote the rule of law and a culture of lawfulness. The expert meeting was convened to begin work toward the preparation of these documents.
4. **Aims of the expert consultation meeting.** The meeting had three broad objectives: (1.) To help clarify the conceptual foundation of the partnership; (2.) to identify the measures that can be taken in the education sector to promote a culture of lawfulness; (3.) and to identify effective educational approaches. Thus, the meeting is meant to elucidate core concepts and identify promising educational approaches in the promotion of a culture of lawfulness by asking fundamental questions, including: What constitutes the rule of law and a culture of lawfulness? How do we create demand for the rule of law? How do we ensure learners apply these principles? How do we ensure they survive in a context where there is no rule of law?
5. **The report structure.** The present report is primarily structured around the content of the sessions. For the sake of coherence and to avoid redundancy, when a particular theme emerged in multiple sessions its discussion in the report is largely confined to the one in which it was discussed most thoroughly. The report opens with a discussion of the introductory presentations that set out crucial definitions and clarifications related to the rule of law and a culture of lawfulness (Section II). The following section discusses the various roles education can play in promoting the rule of law and a culture of lawfulness (Section III). The report then underscores considerations that are key to teaching individuals to be ethically responsible agents of change in both formal and non-formal educational contexts (Section IV). A number of country case studies that illustrate the challenges and promises of various educational approaches in terms of the pursuit of lawfulness are then considered (Section V), followed by a discussion of factors essential to enabling, promoting, and sustain education of this sort (Section VI). The final section of the report summarizes the key findings and the principal recommendations set out during the meeting (Section VII).

II. What is the rule of law and a culture of lawfulness?

- The rule of law and a culture of lawfulness in the context of UNODC’s Education for Justice (E4J) initiative (Gilberto Duarte, UNODC)
 - Different perspectives on a culture of lawfulness (Daniela Piana)
 - Crime and unlawful behaviour (Ágnes Németh)
6. Because they are complex and socio-politically situated, a great deal of confusion exists regarding what the “rule of law” and a “culture of lawfulness” actually mean. The opening session addressed these questions directly by

considering the UN's own designations, related fundamental conceptual issues, and the emergence of these concepts within a crime prevention context.

7. **The rule of law.** The Secretary General states that the rule of law is, “a principle of governance in which all persons, institutions and entities, public and private, including the State itself, are accountable to laws that are publicly promulgated, equally enforced and independently adjudicated, and which are consistent with international human rights norms and standards.”¹ In this sense, the rule of law applies both to individuals and to the state itself, and the application of the rule of law must be fair, transparent, and consistent. In fact, the Secretary General further recognizes a handful of preconditions for the rule of law: “It requires, as well, measures to ensure adherence to the principles of supremacy of law, equality before the law, accountability to the law, fairness in the application of the law, separation of powers, participation in decision-making, legal certainty, avoidance of arbitrariness and procedural and legal transparency.”² If there are systematic deviations from these principles, then the rule of law is impeded. In other words, the rule of law can only exist to the extent the law is not opaque, discriminatory, or inconsistent with international human rights standards. In this sense, the rule of law is an ideal to which states and individuals continually aspire. More concretely, the rule of law involves the entire legal framework and the political apparatus that supports the creation and enforcement of laws. It is the visible and institutionally formalized dimension of the law. When talking about enforcement of the law, the concept of accountability is key: enforcement is important as long as it generates a sense of accountability to laws that fall under the Secretary General's definition of the rule of law, and that notably promote human rights.

8. **A culture of lawfulness.** A culture of lawfulness denotes the socio-cultural conditions that determine how, and to what extent, laws are internalized and applied. It is both practical and cognitive in the sense that it encompasses individuals' expectations about the law, which are reinforced through daily routines, including formal and informal interactions with the law. Thus, a culture of lawfulness is a complex and multifaceted notion that involves all those aspects of a culture that serve as repositories of story-telling about the law and, crucially, enable individuals to make sense of their own relation to the law. For example, by experiencing a consistent and fair application of classroom rules to all of one's peers, a student may come to understand her relation to the law as one of trust. On the contrary, if a student experiences systematic discrimination, if certain children are always favoured over others, her understanding of the law might be characterized by suspicion. Lawfulness also touches many areas of society. As one participant shared, “To me, lawfulness is when a woman knows that she has legal rights in her country, just like a man does. It is when a [foreign] worker knows that if he didn't get his monthly salary from his employer, he can go and ask for it legally just like a local employee can. It is when a government employee from a different religious group is entitled to a promotion for a higher position just like his colleague from the dominant group has.”

9. **An embedded, holistic approach.** Discussion in this session emphasized that since a culture of lawfulness is necessarily culturally embedded, policy-making at the highest levels must be supplemented with similarly embedded, engaged work within communities. In fact, since the relationship between the rule of law and a culture of lawfulness is one of mutual reinforcement, a truly holistic approach is crucial. Creating the appropriate structural elements to support the rule of law without a complimentary culture of lawfulness is unlikely to be fruitful. Similarly, a culture of lawfulness is unlikely to thrive in the absence of facilitating governmental structures. Additionally, since cultures evolve quickly, in developing tools to promote lawfulness one should pay particular attention to new and emerging cultural contexts that serve as alternative models of lawfulness, including online media.

III. What is the role of education?

- A crime prevention officer's perspective (Lulua Asaad)
- An educator's perspective (Pavel Chacuk)
- A policymaker's perspective (Annet Mugisha)

10. **A culture of lawfulness and education.** Since education is one of the most pronounced facilitators of a culture of lawfulness, it is one of the most effective means of developing the skills within learners to make informed and

¹ Report of the Secretary-General: The rule of law and transitional justice in conflict and post-conflict societies (S/2004/616) retrieved from <https://www.un.org/ruleoflaw/blog/document/the-rule-of-law-and-transitional-justice-in-conflict-and-post-conflict-societies-report-of-the-secretary-general/>

² Ibid.

responsible decisions, notably as concerns the refusal and prevention of crime. Educators not only serve as role models of the law, but also promote active literacy of legal concepts at all levels, facilitating students as they interpret the law at the national level (policy, legislation), the community level (norms, traditions), and the personal level (within their own educational contexts and their families).

11. **Types of crime prevention and the scope of educational relevance.** As suggested in Session I, crime prevention is often misunderstood. In its broadest sense, it entails much more than merely creating deterrents to actual criminal activity. It includes assessing and addressing economic, social, and psychological factors that enable crime (primary prevention), reaching out to those most likely to victimize or be victimized and aiding in the prevention of repeated victimization (secondary prevention), and educating those within the criminal justice system with the aim of reducing recidivism (tertiary prevention). Education can facilitate crime prevention at each of these levels in three broad ways:

- (1.) by informing individuals about their rights, responsibilities, and the consequences of their behaviours,
- (2.) by facilitating behavioural changes brought about by transformed mind-sets,
- (3.) and by creating the willingness, demand, and capabilities for broader social change within communities.

UNODC's particular mandate areas can be directly addressed by education that promotes the appropriate values, skills, and knowledge, which involves a thorough consideration of all levels of educational intervention, from policy to the support of communities and families.

12. **Policy.** Given the diffuse nature of the cultural mechanisms that support or hinder lawfulness and their complex relationships with actual legal frameworks, policymakers would be wise to adopt holistic approaches to governance in this respect. Apart from simply equipping schools with good resources for civic education, they should ensure that this information is clear, unbiased, and that it reaches all sectors of society. Additionally, it should be reinforced with practical examples. Policymakers are vitally important in helping shape educational environments by developing (or supporting the development of) transformative pedagogy aimed at peace-building, creating thoroughly safe educational learning environments, and promoting learning that encourages participation in the culture of lawfulness and dialogue about this means.

13. **Formal education.** Since the school is, in a sense, a microcosm of society, modelling lawfulness here is essential. By providing participatory exercises, allowing students to make sense of the law as not merely something that stands beyond them but as something that they are active in creating and supporting, one promotes a culture of lawfulness, which has consequences well beyond the classroom. Formal education has to be inclusive, ensuring that everyone believes and feels that they are part of the community. While teaching pro-social behaviours is crucial, providing educational practices that reinforce these behaviours is equally important. In other words, since we often learn best by doing, providing students with concrete exercises (role playing, dialogues, community governance activities) that allow them to work on actively being considerate, tolerant, other-oriented is key to fostering a culture of lawfulness. By engaging their classmates in ways that anticipate conflicts they are likely to experience outside of the classroom, students will be better equipped to address such challenges and more likely to be respectful of others' differences.

14. **Informal education.** Although formal education is key to promoting the rule of law and a culture of lawfulness, its reach is constrained by outside influences. When there are strong and systematic deviations from the rule of law outside the classroom, the formal education students receive can come to seem artificial or irrelevant. Consequently, informal and non-formal educational approaches are key to the pursuit of lawfulness, from engaging communities in collaborations to providing individuals with opportunities to creatively challenge media that glorifies violence and criminality. Sports are particularly useful in this respect, as they encourage collaboration within the context of an exercise of a kind of lawfulness. Games have rules, clear and simple goal-oriented structures, that transfer to broader notions of lawfulness.

15. **Education in the family.** A child's first experiences of the law is their family and school. Most of the time teachers are subject to pressure and stereotypes, therefore collective efforts that involves the parents are important (It takes a village to educate a child). Just as fostering and supporting appropriate educational programmes is crucial to the promotion of a culture of lawfulness, so too is supporting—and seeking the support of—parents. Parents are often best positioned to help combat naïve but common negative associations between punishment and the law. Differentiating between punishment and the law involves explaining the rationale of a given law, not just emphasizing the negative consequences of failing to abide by it, and equipping teachers and parents with the tools to

do so seems imperative. Approaches to involve parents and families differ between primary and secondary education, particularly as ideas and perceptions of role models differ from younger to older children.

16. **Crucial educational concerns in relation to the rule of law.** To the extent that education is often conceived of as teaching students to think critically about the world around them, it can seem to be in tension with upholding the rule of law. Yet, thinking critically about legal structures enables individuals to more deeply appreciate them and to more fully internalize them. Furthermore, the rule of law is not the same as simple, unreflective obedience to the law, especially when laws violate international human rights standards. This prompts a handful of pressing questions: How do we teach students to be critical, open-minded, and globally engaged reasoners in the context of human rights violations or other impediments to the rule of law? Additionally, what knowledge, skills, and behaviours must students be taught in such a context? When there are inconsistencies between values taught in the classroom and the society at large, how can one avoid frustration, anger, and the like and instead be motivated to improve the situation? Similarly, how does one go about challenging imperfections in the law in a lawful manner?

IV. Learning to be ethically responsible agents of change

- Developing skills and values (Elysa Christy)
- Upholding strong institutions (Luisa de Bivar Black)
- Taking non-violent action (Aya Chebbi)

17. **Education must be developmentally appropriate.** In developing educational tools and policies to promote the rule of law and a culture of lawfulness, it is important to ensure that they are developmentally appropriate. For example, in the primary years children are fairly concrete and would therefore benefit most from precise, well-calibrated examples instead of abstract lessons on UNODC mandate areas. The idea is to educate students with a developmentally appropriate set of skills and values that transfer to later fostering a more sophisticated and mature culture of lawfulness.

18. **Grounded in the GCED framework.** Crucially, many of the very sorts of values and skills promoted in Global Citizenship Education (GCED) contexts are of paramount importance to the promotion of the rule of law and a culture of lawfulness. In terms of values, education on the rule of law and a culture of lawfulness involve teaching acceptance, fairness, integrity, and respect. In terms of skills, it encourages students to learn to address conflict, to think critically, to empathize with others, and to work well in teams. Certain competencies aimed at fostering a democratic culture in a European context are likely useful in the broader promotion of lawfulness. For example, in addition to the aforementioned values and skills, educational programmes aimed at promoting a culture of lawfulness could strive to foster certain attitudes and critical understandings. Openness to cultural otherness, respect, civic-mindedness, responsibility, self-efficacy, and tolerance of ambiguity are especially useful attitudes in this context. Similarly, an understanding of one's self, a solid grasp of language, and a broad and truly global sense of concerns seem constitutive of a well-developed and nuanced appreciation of a culture of lawfulness.

19. **Consider assessment approaches.** Establishing benchmarks that test for core competencies like these, testing for students' familiarity with these concepts, enables comparisons across schools and a quantitative sense of whether educators are making progress.

20. **Start early.** Finally, targeted educational interventions should strive to address early behaviours with clear and lasting benefits in terms of criminality and security, health and well-being later in life. This is especially the case for bullying, which has been unmistakably linked to negative outcomes later in life both for bullies and their victims, and is key to the prevention of crime and violence. Further, such early intervention approaches are critical to investing in the future generation and empowering them to be agents of positive change in their communities and societies.

21. **Collaborating with non-traditional actors.** While formal, informal, and non-formal educational practices are clearly crucial to bringing about ethically responsible change, activists are also instrumental. Being united with other activists, joining groups of people pursuing non-violence, provides individuals with a trans-national identity and sense of belonging, an affiliation with a set of values that surpasses tribalism and regional in-fighting. Those intent on promoting a culture of lawfulness, especially in social and political contexts in which actual legal frameworks are deeply flawed, can draw inspiration from activists. A number of practices are useful in this respect. The foremost of these are: promoting creative conversations about privilege; enabling artistic expressions that foster self-reflection;

encouraging meditation and mindfulness practices; actively creating collective identities that reframe prejudicial and harmful narratives; providing safe spaces where people can reflect without fear of punishment.

22. **Strategic educational interventions.** The discussion during this session reemphasized the importance of strategically targeted educational and instructional interventions in relation to promoting the rule of law and a culture of lawfulness. Just as materials need to be developmentally appropriate, they might need to differentiate between kinds of lawlessness or criminality. For instance, while littering or breaking traffic rules are very visible examples of certain kinds of crime, targeting just these behaviours is unlikely to help promote lawfulness more broadly. In addition to differentiating at this level, educators could frame all instances of crime as types of antisocial behaviour while working to actively promote prosocial behaviour, both through instruction and practice.

23. **Relevance of political context.** The discussion likewise pursued the question of whether and to what extent the promotion of a culture of lawfulness depends on a particular governmental system and what to do when the rule of law seems to have failed. While directly challenging certain overarching legal constructs—like the structure of a flawed or discriminatory legal system—might be impossible in certain cases, students and agents of social change can nevertheless pursue creative forms of non-violent critique. How can citizens be ethically responsible when there are unequal and biased laws? Key to such a strategy is emphasizing local, visible expressions of a culture of lawfulness to the extent this is possible, like promoting pluralism and egalitarianism within a classroom or combating sexist practices within a community.

V. Country case studies

- School-based educational programmes for crime prevention in difficult contexts: an example from Mexico (Veronica Martinez Solares)
- Implementing ethics education programmes in Kenya and Tanzania (Vera Leal)
- Pedagogies to promote moderation (Nasharudin Mat Isa)
- Violence prevention programmes in Ecuador (Selene Pineda)
- Learnings from educational programmes in Indonesia and South Africa (Charaf Ahmimed)

24. There is now a rich and varied set of national programmes pursuing the rule of law and a culture of lawfulness that can help orient and inform the current initiative. Many nuanced and comprehensive programmes were discussed.

25. **Case study: Mexico.** In Mexico, there have been promising school-based educational programmes for crime prevention in especially violent communities. In this context, a culture of lawfulness has been understood as a pedagogical project that translates broad ethical principles into school-based skills, especially conflict-management. These programmes targeting particularly violent cities have uncovered a handful of mediating factors that are likely to increase or decrease the incidence of violent crime, including peer influences, whether one is a male, and the presence or absence of safe zones. The programmes have found it particularly important to not merely address students, but to coordinate efforts with teachers, family members, and especially mothers. Women's empowerment programmes have been particularly useful in this effort. There are on-going longitudinal studies to determine whether and to what extent these promising interventions have long-term effects.

26. **Case study: Ecuador.** Similarly, there are related efforts to find the most effective strategies for combating Latin America's high homicide rates. As has been emphasized elsewhere, crime is a complex and multifaceted phenomenon and addressing any particular type of crime requires a consideration of the broad network of social and economic influences at work as well as the immediate educational and psychological precursors. Ecuador has experienced a steady decrease in homicides since 2010 when a multi-pronged approach was implemented by the government. The government's method prioritized crime prevention over reactive strategies, increased quality and access to education, pursued broad judicial reform, and emphasized de-centralized, local policing strategies.

27. **Case studies: Tanzania and Kenya.** In Tanzania and Kenya there are programmes that take an ethics education approach to pursuing the rule of law and a culture of lawfulness. These emphasize safe, context-specific learning environments that are participatory in nature. Through games and imaginative exercises, students are encouraged to think critically about the sources of differences and to generate both motivations for, and examples of, peaceful coexistence in diverse contexts. In Tanzania, Peace Clubs have been promising in this regard, as they

encourage students to engage in meaningful dialogue concerning violent extremism and prompt them to examine the factors that lead to radicalization and violence. In Kenya, there are initiatives aimed at addressing violence resulting from differences between tribal groups. These, too, emphasize dialogues aimed at overcoming stereotypes of others, fostering friendships across divides, and providing students with alternatives to violence.

28. **Case study: The Philippines.** In Southeast Asia, there are a number of projects specifically aimed at promoting peaceful coexistence and fighting violent extremism. Among many other initiatives, there have been interreligious dialogues directed at religious leaders supported by a broad network of local, regional, and national partners. One of the primary strategies that has been adopted in the Philippines, for example, is to anticipate the very attractive narratives that certain young Muslims will hear and help them proactively combat these. Many of the narratives that are used to entice young people into violent extremism here will draw on their status as a minority. Consequently, much of the message in the Philippines is tailored at making sense of oneself in the context of other, more dominant faith traditions without feeling marginalized or threatened.

29. **Case study: Indonesia.** There are similar programmes in Indonesia run by NGOs that are meant to help students make sense of why a person becomes an extremist. Certain other Indonesian programmes involve local teachers and communities in the development of a part of the curriculum, making it especially regionally specific and pertinent to the students. The possible downside of such an approach is that sensitive subjects that are undervalued by governments may remain underrepresented, especially LGBTQ rights and the like.

30. **Additional country-specific observations.** Hungary has taken a particularly broad approach to crime prevention that includes an educational component. Uganda aims to pursue lawfulness by civic education that reaches all sectors of society, emphasizing participatory teaching, and pursues strong political support in this respect. Educational interventions in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia have been complimented with private sector actors focused on particular concerns.

31. **The role of gender.** The discussion following this session again emphasized the importance of developing context-specific and practical interventions, including games that students are likely to enjoy. Participants underscored the role gender plays in susceptibility to different kinds of crimes and receptivity to education to prevent these crimes, suggesting that well-tailored educational strategies should be especially conscientious about narratives regarding gender.

32. **Issues requiring further consideration.** The discussion concluded with a handful of related questions: How do educators and policymakers ensure that the lessons learned in intentionally developed safe spaces like classrooms persist outside of those spaces and in the real world? In other words, how does one ensure that education of this sort is sustainable? Participants repeatedly emphasized the challenge of teaching the skills required to promote the rule of law and a culture of lawfulness when such concepts are rendered seemingly irrelevant by profoundly unethical or corrupt social and political contexts. Participants highlighted the necessity of longitudinal studies evaluating the long-term effects of educational interventions.

VI. Enabling educational policies

- Education programmes that promote public integrity (Carissa Munro)
- Peace and Human Rights Education (Vachararutai Boontinand)
- From the perspective of non-state education initiatives (Basma Bushnak)
- Towards a network for tackling corruption through integrity (Luciana Asper y Valdes)

33. **A holistic approach to education in order to ensure public integrity.** Previous sessions underscored that corruption is one of the most prominent obstacles opposed to the rule of law and the pursuit of a culture of lawfulness. It not only directly contributes to lawlessness, but it has diffuse consequences that inhibit a culture of lawfulness by undermining the integrity of public institutions across sectors. Consequently, to promote lawfulness one must address the root causes and the myriad social and political consequences of corruption. This entails taking a truly holistic educational approach and promoting a culture of integrity within both business and civil society.

34. **Education for public integrity in formal contexts.** In traditional educational contexts, one can promote a culture of public integrity by having activities and lessons that aim to build ethical character and equip students with

specific knowledge and skills to resist corruption outside school. Ongoing work in Greece has demonstrated that there are often trade-offs between political considerations and educational objectives, and also between long-term considerations and quick fixes. Though the latter are often appealing as they provide clear and visible evidence of intentions (a day against corruption, etc.), truly sustainable educational interventions will often need to prioritize less visible and sometimes incremental approaches that are likely to have long-lasting consequences. The efforts in Greece have additionally illustrated the importance of drawing on existing policy and curriculum to the extent this is feasible.

35. ***Learning from peace and human rights education.*** Educators and policymakers intent on bringing about a culture of lawfulness through education would do well to attend to the rich literature on education for human rights and education for peace. While both literatures have different emphases and approaches, they are complimentary and likely useful in the present context. For example, education for peace distinguishes between negative peace (a mere absence of violence) and positive peace (peace that encompasses larger notions of justice). Considerations regarding the rule of law and an accompanying culture of lawfulness are likely to differ in situations of negative and positive peace. Additionally, education for peace often emphasizes the importance of conflict within a culture, as it is often productive and indicative of true diversity. So education for peace emphasizes the importance of conflict transformation instead of conflict resolution. Similarly, education in the human rights context is aimed at transformation, where the goal is not merely to teach *about* human rights, but to teach *for* human rights, empowering students and teachers to take action for social change. In certain cases, this might present both opportunities and challenges for the pursuit of the rule of law and a culture of lawfulness, especially where there are conflicts between governmental educational objectives and broader human rights considerations.

36. ***Working with private sector entities.*** Key to enabling educational policies that promote the rule of law and a culture of lawfulness is supplementing governmental imbalances, oversights, or deficits with both for-profit and not-for-profit initiatives. These organizations can keep a narrow focus on considerations that might otherwise get overlooked. By working outside of—but in concert with—existing governmental mechanisms, for-profits and not-for-profits can help coordinate activities that are important in the pursuit of a culture of lawfulness that might be underemphasized otherwise. For example, an emphasis on clear, quantifiable outcomes with international repercussions, like rankings in literacy and STEM performance, can easily overshadow the sorts of ethical initiatives needed in the present context. Non-state actors have a special role to play here.

37. ***Working with prosecutor and judicial systems.*** Similarly, especially motivated individuals within state organizations but without direct mandates to foster a culture of lawfulness can be instrumental. For example, in Brazil prosecutors fed up with primarily addressing the consequences of corruption have begun a broad and far-reaching national programme aimed at addressing the antecedents of the crime. As in other contexts, the prosecutors have found a truly holistic approach crucial to their work. Consequently, they partner with businesses, teachers and schools, and within communities, balancing highly visible, immediate programmes—like a hackfest against corruption and widespread media campaigns—with long-term interventions including training teachers who then run their own teacher-training workshops at a local level. They support creative, local initiatives, especially those fostering participatory pedagogical approaches with high student engagement, including a “civic audit” in which the students of one particular school were given active roles in actually enforcing lawfulness on the campus.

38. ***Supporting sustained behaviour change beyond the classroom.*** The discussion during this section focused largely on the sustainability of education aimed at a culture of lawfulness and ensuring that these initiatives translate to behavioural change beyond the classroom. A number of factors were considered crucial to ensuring sustainability, including: (1.) promoting truly region-specific programmes, as some of the initiatives that seem to be working in the Brazilian context have had less success in the Mexican context, for example; (2.) encouraging participatory accountability across sectors with “ripple effects” beyond their immediate settings, like fostering broadly pro-social behaviours; (3.) using visible structures that evoke lawfulness indirectly, including sports and other games with clear rules and consequences for violating those rules.

VII. Closing considerations

39. ***The need for innovative approaches.*** The challenges confronting policymakers and teachers in promoting the rule of law and a culture of lawfulness require creativity and innovation for at least three reasons: (1.) Education in this context is simply much broader than in other contexts. The learning required goes beyond traditional cognitive outcomes and is manifest behaviourally. Thus, policy makers and educators accustomed to thinking of education in

largely passive ways, will be challenged to think in terms of active, participatory educational interventions aimed at clear and long-lasting behavioural change. (2.) To the extent certain educational system exists in circumstances of pervasive inequality, systematic human rights violations and the like, policy makers and educators will need to pursue creative partnerships beyond the classroom to get cultural footholds. They will likewise need to adopt holistic educational approaches within the classroom aimed at ameliorating and addressing the emotional and psychological consequences of the dissonance between prevailing social norms and their ethical aspirations. (3.) Finally, translating ethical considerations into engaging, accurate, and comprehensive material for learners is itself a challenging and requires creativity, as evidenced by the development of *The Zorbs*.

40. **Materials need to balance local and global considerations.** One of the most recurrent themes that emerged throughout the meeting was the need to balance local and global considerations in the development of educational interventions aimed at promoting lawfulness. There are two related points to be made here. First, educational materials need to address prominent and particularly corrosive crimes that systematically threaten the rule of law and public integrity, including corruption and the like; however, the materials clearly cannot address all crimes, and so must seek to impart general ethical principles that learners can use to confront unexpected and diverse criminal prompts as they arise. Secondly, since the materials will be used in diverse contexts, they need to be flexible enough to be adapted regionally but rigid enough to avoid sacrificing core values.

41. **Importance of attending to media and social or virtual networks.** Furthermore, it is important to bear in mind that what constitutes a “regional” consideration is problematic in increasingly interconnected communities, a point made repeatedly throughout the various sessions. Educators and policy makers are often accustomed to thinking in terms of vertical relationships; however, especially where complex cultural phenomena are concerned they will need to think in terms of broad horizontal networks, especially including virtual communities. Equipping learners to promote the rule of law and a culture of lawfulness now clearly extends well beyond one’s immediate local community, as learners may belong to any number of virtual communities and are increasingly mobile.

42. **Specific considerations for development of materials.** Participants offered a number of final suggestions regarding the development of the material. Given the already illustrated relationship between a number of ongoing educational initiatives and the current pursuit—especially education for human rights and peace education—it could be worthwhile to examine these literatures for approaches that could be useful for the promotion of a culture of lawfulness. Similarly, a broad meta-analysis of the most valuable means of countering certain forms of criminality and violence could be beneficial. Participants suggested that the content of the toolkit should have many flexible activities and resources such that regions can choose those most suitable for their needs. Crucially, the toolkit might have special considerations for communities that have experienced trauma. Although discussions of the rule of law and a culture of lawfulness naturally lend themselves to certain subjects (civics, life skill training, etc.), it could be useful to systematically review possible entry points in different curricula across regions, which could help identify strategic partners. Finally, a number of participants indicated that it is important to begin to think about ways to quantify outcomes even at this stage. At a local level, the toolkit could propose ways of discerning whether learners seem to be transferring skills they acquire through training and education for lawfulness to the community at large. Children and youth should be involved in the development of materials and tools, notably by offering creative ways of empowerment through the use of arts, to adequately reflect the importance of identity and belonging in the development process.

43. **Looking forward.** As the presentations concluded, participants discussed the next steps and committed to continuing the work, to reviewing forthcoming drafts of documents in preparation of the guidance and toolkit materials. Many likewise agreed on the continued usefulness of their existing networks in the preparation of the material. For example, absent global monitoring and evaluation efforts, participants can nevertheless continue to offer useful feedback on promising political, social, and educational approaches, as many are actively evaluating their own results. Similarly, many offered to help pilot the toolkit or be involved in capacity building with these instruments in the future.

UNESCO Education Sector

Education is UNESCO's top priority because it is a basic human right and the foundation on which to build peace and drive sustainable development. UNESCO is the United Nations' specialized agency for education and the Education Sector provides global and regional leadership in education, strengthens national education systems and responds to contemporary global challenges through education with a special focus on gender equality and Africa.



Education
Sector

The Global Education 2030 Agenda

UNESCO, as the United Nations' specialized agency for education, is entrusted to lead and coordinate the Education 2030 Agenda, which is part of a global movement to eradicate poverty through 17 Sustainable Development Goals by 2030. Education, essential to achieve all of these goals, has its own dedicated Goal 4, which aims to *"ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all."* The Education 2030 Framework for Action provides guidance for the implementation of this ambitious goal and commitments.



Global Citizenship Education for the Rule of Law

The UNESCO/UNODC partnership on "Global Citizenship Education for the Rule of Law" aims to strengthen the capacities of education policy-makers, educators, teacher trainers and curriculum developers to promote the rule of law through education. More specifically, the partnership supports professionals in education design and implement educational interventions that equip learners with the knowledge, attitudes and skills to constructively and responsibly engage in society, uphold the principle of justice and help build effective, accountable and inclusive institutions at all levels.



The Doha Declaration:
PROMOTING A CULTURE
OF LAWFULNESS



Stay in touch



Lydia Ruprecht
Team Leader, Global Citizenship Education
UNESCO
Paris, France
Email: l.ruprecht@unesco.org



<https://en.unesco.org/themes/gced/rule-law>

